

**City of Atlanta Board of Ethics and Independent Compliance  
Meeting Minutes of September 19, 2019**

The monthly meeting of the City of Atlanta Board of Ethics and Independent Compliance was called to order by Board Chair Kate Wasch at 6:04 p.m. in the City Council Committee Room 1, 55 Trinity Avenue, Atlanta, Georgia 30303. Attending the meeting were board members Chris Gilmore, Todd Gray, Matt Grosvenor, Lisa Liang and Gerry Neumark. Ethics Officer Jabu M. Sengova and staff members Carlos R. Santiago, Sherry H. Dawson, Janet R. Keene, Larry Mason, Ibi Onabanjo and Portia Reeves also attended. Board members Nichola Hines and Wesley Tharpe were absent.

**MINUTES**

1. Ms. Liang moved to approve the minutes of the July 18, 2019 board meeting. Dr. Neumark seconded the motion which was unanimously approved by the Board.

**BOARD OPERATIONS**

2. **Introduction and welcome of new board member, Matt Grosvenor**  
Ms. Wasch introduced Matt Grosvenor, Partner in Financial Reporting and Assurance and Advisory Services at Bennett Thrasher LLP, nominated to the Board of Ethics and Independent Compliance by the Georgia Society of Certified Public Accountants.

**FINANCIAL DISCLOSURE HEARINGS**

3. **Documentary Evidence and Sanctions Requested**

Mr. Santiago presented Exhibits 1 through 5 as documentary evidence of notices sent to persons who were required to file the City Financial Disclosure Statement pursuant to Section 2-814 of the Code of Ordinances. Ms. Liang made a motion to approve Exhibits 1 through 5 as proper notice of the requirements to file under Section 2-814. Mr. Gilmore seconded the motion which was unanimously approved by the Board.

Mr. Santiago presented evidence of persons who violated Section 2-814(e) of the Code of Ethics by failing to file the 2019 City Financial Disclosure Statement by the filing deadline without reasonable cause. He requested that the Board issue written reprimands and impose fines ranging from \$50 to \$250 in administrative sanctions and require that all fines be paid by the delinquent filers prior to any reemployment by the City.

4. **Filers Appearing before the Board**

**FD-19-012 In the Matter of Deborah Harris (late filer)**  
Former City Employee: filed 6/24/19 Sanction requested: \$250

Ms. Harris was present at the meeting and addressed the Board. Ms. Harris stated that she filed an appeal when she received an invoice for payment from the Ethics Office and she contacted the office. She stated that while employed

with the City, she timely filed her financial disclosure statements annually and did not realize that she was required to file one year after her retirement from the City. Thereafter, Ms. Harris requested a waiver of the fine. Following a brief discussion, Dr. Neumark made a motion that Ms. Harris' case be deferred for further review by the Ethics Office and be presented at the October meeting of the Board. Mr. Grosvenor seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved by the Board.

**FD-19-096 In the Matter of Marvin Lenorris Taylor, Sr. (late filer)**

Current City Employee: filed 7/6/19 Sanction requested: \$250

Mr. Santiago presented a recommendation that the fine be reduced in this case from \$250 to \$125. Mr. Taylor was present at the meeting and addressed the Board. Mr. Taylor stated that he had not filed the City Financial Disclosure Statement in his six years as a city employee, and this was his first year that he was required to file. He explained that the reason his filing was not timely was due to technical difficulties with accessing the system. Mr. Gilmore made a motion to reduce Mr. Taylor's fine to \$125 with the recommendation that he timely file his disclosure statement going forward. Mr. Gray seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved by the Board.

**5. Late Filers – No Appeals Filed**

**FD-19-007 In the Matter of Darnell Forbes**

Former City Employee: filed 6/24/19 Sanction requested: \$250

**FD-19-008 In the Matter of Tamar Gantt**

Former City Employee: filed 4/16/19 Sanction requested: \$50

**FD-19-056 In the Matter of Nathan Gibson**

Current City Employee: filed 9/13/19 Sanction requested: \$250

**FD-19-013 In the Matter of Brandon Paul Hughes**

Former City Employee: filed 6/21/19 Sanction requested: \$250

**FD-19-015 In the Matter of Pamela Lee**

Current Board Member: filed 4/18/19 Sanction requested: \$50

**FD-19-016 In the Matter of Dominique Madison**

Former City Employee: filed 4/22/19 Sanction requested: \$50

**FD-19-019 In the Matter of Anthony McKee**

Former City Employee: filed 4/17/19 Sanction requested: \$50

**FD-19-020 In the Matter of Arthur Morris**

Former City Employee: filed 5/23/19 Sanction requested: \$150

**FD-19-022 In the Matter of Jannquell Peters**

Former City Employee: filed 4/16/19 Sanction requested: \$50

**FD-19-028 In the Matter of Caroline Campbell Smith**

Former City Employee: filed 4/17/19 Sanction requested: \$50

**FD-19-030 In the Matter of Rodney Thomas**

Current City Employee: filed 6/7/19 Sanction requested: \$200

**FD-19-035 In the Matter of Erica Willis**

Current Board Member: filed 7/10/19 Sanction requested: \$250

**FD-19-038 In the Matter of Daisy Qian Yu**

Former City Employee: filed 4/17/19 Sanction requested: \$50

Mr. Santiago presented the cases to the Board to find the late filers in violation of Section 2-814 and adopt the appropriate sanctions in each case. Mr. Gray moved to find the late filers listed in violation of Section 2-814 and to adopt sanctions as presented by Mr. Santiago. Ms. Liang seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved by the Board.

**6. Late Filers – Appeals Filed**

Mr. Santiago presented appeals in five late filer cases and requested the matters be entered into the record as Exhibit 6. Ms. Liang made a motion to enter Exhibit 6 into the record as evidence of the respondents' appeals. Mr. Gilmore seconded the motion which was unanimously approved by the Board.

**FD-19-001 In the Matter of Oliver Clyde Allen**

Current Board Member: filed 6/26/19 Sanction requested: \$125

Mr. Santiago reported that Mr. Allen filed an appeal acknowledging his late filing and requesting a reduction in the fine. Mr. Santiago recommended reducing the fine to \$125. Ms. Liang moved to find Mr. Allen in violation of Section 2-814 and to adopt the reduced sanctions as presented. Dr. Neumark seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved by the Board.

**FD-19-009 In the Matter of Cicely Garrett**

Former City Employee: filed 7/18/19 Sanction requested: \$125

Mr. Santiago reported that Ms. Garrett filed an appeal explaining she had left City employment and did not realize that she was required to file the disclosure statement. Mr. Santiago recommended reducing the fine to \$125. Ms. Liang moved to find Ms. Garrett in violation of Section 2-814 and to adopt the reduced sanctions as presented. Dr. Neumark seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved by the Board.

**FD-19-017 In the Matter of Mizelle Marshall**

Former City Employee: filed 4/20/19 Sanction requested: \$50

Mr. Santiago reported that Mr. Marshall filed an appeal explaining he had left City employment and did not believe he was required to file the disclosure statement. Mr. Santiago requested that the Board deny the appeal. Ms. Liang moved to find Mr. Marshall in violation of Section 2-814 and to adopt the sanctions as

presented. Mr. Gray seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved by the Board.

**FD-19-080 In the Matter of Rhonda Morgan**

Former Board Member: filed 9/16/19 Sanction requested: \$125

Mr. Santiago reported that Ms. Morgan filed an appeal indicating she did not know that she was required to complete the form and that she believed the notices were sent in error. Mr. Santiago recommended reducing the fine to \$125. Ms. Liang moved to find Ms. Morgan in violation of Section 2-814 and to adopt the reduced sanctions as presented. Mr. Gilmore seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved by the Board.

**FD-19-029 In the Matter of Alexis Janae Terry**

Former City Employee: filed 4/25/19 Sanction requested: \$50

Mr. Santiago reported that Ms. Terry filed an appeal indicating she had been instructed by her former City supervisor that her business with the City had concluded and that no further action was necessary. Mr. Santiago recommended denial of the appeal for lack of reasonable cause. Dr. Neumark moved to find Ms. Terry in violation of Section 2-814 and to adopt the sanctions as presented. Mr. Gilmore seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved by the Board.

**7. Nonfilers – No Appeals Filed**

Ms. Onabanjo presented evidence that the nonfilers listed below violated Section 2-814 of the Code of Ethics by failing to file the 2019 Financial Disclosure Statement without reasonable cause. Having no opposition, Ms. Onabanjo submitted that the facts as stated in the administrative decisions should be admitted as evidence and form the basis for penalties imposed in the cases. Ms. Onabanjo proposed penalties pursuant to Board Rule 8.9 for each case as follows: administrative sanctions of \$500, issuance of a written public reprimand, recommendation that for those who are former employees that the City consider them ineligible for rehire for one year and for those who are board members that the City consider them ineligible to serve on a City Board for one year, and the requirement to pay any fines owed prior to reemployment by the City or reappointment to a City Board.

**FD-19-039 In the Matter of Robert Barker, Jr.**

Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-040 In the Matter of Kenneth Bice**

Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-042 In the Matter of Julie Broadus**

Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-043 In the Matter of Gino Brogdon**

Former Board Member Sanction requested: \$500

- FD-19-045 In the Matter of Daniel Burroughs**  
Current Board Member Sanction requested: \$500
- FD-19-046 In the Matter of Semona Campbell**  
Current Board Member Sanction requested: \$500
- FD-19-047 In the Matter of Tony Chalmers**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500
- FD-19-048 In the Matter of Shikara Chin**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500
- FD-19-049 In the Matter of John R. Colonel**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500
- FD-19-050 In the Matter of Dwayne Daniel**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500
- FD-19-051 In the Matter of Eros P. Davis**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500
- FD-19-054 In the Matter of Tiona Doctor**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500
- FD-19-057 In the Matter of Vijay Gogineni**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500
- FD-19-058 In the Matter of Christopher Jamal Goines**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500
- FD-19-059 In the Matter of Leigha Grant**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500
- FD-19-061 In the Matter of Robert Ivin Harper**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500
- FD-19-062 In the Matter of Ollie Harper**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500
- FD-19-063 In the Matter of Kia B. Jackson**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500
- FD-19-065 In the Matter of Tommy L. Jenkins**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500
- FD-19-066 In the Matter of Sharon R. Jones**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500
- FD-19-067 In the Matter of Chenee Joseph**  
Current Board Member Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-069 In the Matter of Kevin Damon Keith**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-070 In the Matter of John M. Kelsey**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-071 In the Matter of Miss Lawrence**  
Current Board Member Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-073 In the Matter of Catherine Anne LeMay**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-074 In the Matter of Kenneth Edward Leonard, Jr.**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-075 In the Matter of William Henry Lipscomb, Jr.**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-076 In the Matter of Dwayne Mack**  
Current Board Member Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-078 In the Matter of Derrick M. McNeil**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-079 In the Matter of Jenya Meggs**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-082 In the Matter of Pamela Muhammad Price**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-083 In the Matter of Rodney Mullins**  
Current Board Member Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-084 In the Matter of Tawanna Payton**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-085 In the Matter of Jane Rawlings**  
Current Board Member Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-086 In the Matter of Gary Redding**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-090 In the Matter of Keith Sharp**  
Former Board Member Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-091 In the Matter of Charles Shelton**  
Former Board Member Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-092 In the Matter of Julius Sinkfield**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-093 In the Matter of Larry Smith, Jr.**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-094 In the Matter of Charlie Stanford**  
Current Board Member Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-095 In the Matter of Tiffanie Stuckey**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-098 In the Matter of Tom Tidwell**  
Former Board Member Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-099 In the Matter of Octavia Vogel**  
Current Board Member Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-100 In the Matter of Matthew C. Williams**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500

**FD-19-102 In the Matter of Annette L. Williams-Gonzales**  
Former City Employee Sanction requested: \$500

Mr. Gray made a motion to find the nonfilers as presented in violation of Section 2-814 and to adopt the penalties as proposed by Ms. Onabanjo. The motion was seconded by Ms. Liang and, following a brief discussion, unanimously approved by the Board.

**8. Report on Financial Disclosure Statement Audits**

Ms. Keene briefly outlined the history of the financial disclosure requirement in the City of Atlanta and the more recent history of auditing the filed statements. She referenced Section 2-814 and that the audits are testing to the policy.

**ETHICS OFFICER'S REPORT**

**9. Status Report on Activities Performed under the Work Plan**


Ms. Sengova reported on activities that support the Ethics Office Work Plan in the following areas: operations, training, advice, public education and outreach, investigations and enforcement actions, and financial disclosure.

Ms. Sengova reported that she had participated in an FBI Outreach program in Washington, DC hosted by the Ethics and Compliance Section of the FBI. She also highlighted the Ethics Office's continued training efforts citywide. She further reported the Office is exploring a new phase of online training and that the recently published summer newsletter is available in print and online.

**10. FY2020 Budget Report**

Ms. Sengova reported that the Ethics Office was spending as budgeted for the 2020 fiscal year.

Having no further business, the meeting adjourned at 7:15 p.m.

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Jabu M. Sengova".

---

Jabu M. Sengova, Ethics Officer  
Approved October 17, 2019.